



CONSUMERS COMMITTEE

Thursday, June 19, 2013, 3 - 5 PM
NYCDOHMH, 42-09 28th Street, Conf Rm 16-49
Long Island City, NY

Planning Council Members Present: Gregory Cruz (Co-Chair), Randall Bruce (Consumer-At-Large), Deborah Marciano, David Martin

Planning Council Members Absent: Victor Alvarez (Tri-County), Lotus Blackman, Muying Hunt, Felicia Carroll, Gerald DeYounge, Rev. Keith Holder, Pastor Jerome Payne, Tracy Neil

Appointed Community Members Present: Jose Colon-Berdecia, Glen Phillip, Ron Joyner, Yves Gebhardt

Guests: Donald Coble, Mallory Lowenstein

NYCDOHMH: Rafael Molina, Darryl Wong

MEETING MATERIALS DISTRIBUTED:

- Meeting Agenda/Planning Council Ground Rules of Respectful Engagement;
- May 22, 2013 Draft Meeting Minutes;
- 2011 Consumer Advisory Board (CAB) Survey, Planning Council Support Unit, BHAP, NYCDOHMH;
- 2012 NY EMA Client Satisfaction Survey, Research & Evaluation Unit, BHAP, NYCDOHMH;
- 2013 NYHIV Planning Council Consumer Listening Sessions Framing Questions, May 2013;
- NYCDOHMH HIV/AIDS Weekly Update, June 14, 2013;
- Columbia University Outreach Announcement – P3 Project, June 2013; and
- NY HIV Planning Council July & August 2013 calendars

WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS:

Gregory Cruz, Co-Chairs opened the meeting. The group was led in a moment of silence, followed by a group review of the Rules of Respectful Engagement. Darryl Wong reviewed the meeting agenda and materials. The minutes from the May 2013 meeting were reviewed and accepted as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

There was no public comment.

SMALL WORK-GROUP DISCUSSION & DEVELOPMENT OF BEST PRACTICES & RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PART A COMMUNITY ADVISORY BOARDS (CABS) IN NYC

The Committee agreed to breaking into small workgroups of 4-5 persons per group in order to address the themes/findings relating to CAB functioning, including 1) coordination, 2) cohesion/conflict management, 3) team effectiveness, 4) team meeting communication and 5) team meeting leadership. Each workgroup was charged with developing recommendations based on best practices related to the thematic set (1—5, above) of questions, derived from the 2011 CAB Best Practices Survey. These recommendations will be presented to the Executive Committee and then Public Health Solutions for possible inclusion in CAB monitoring and documentation activities during the contractual negotiation and/or renewal processes.

The following recommendations are derived from the group's exercise at the June meeting. The first statement (in bold italics) re-states the issue/question as posed in the survey. The bullets that follow after

are the statements and recommendations formulated by committee members in support of the statement. The finalized recommendations (in red italics) are based on the previous bulleted comments and meant to summarize viewpoints expressed by Committee members.

BOARD FUNCTIONING: COORDINATION

We usually do not get much done in the meetings

- CABs have a monthly agenda
- CABS will conduct meetings monthly and provide a chair, a detailed agenda, minutes, a staff liaison and a clearly delineated process of discussion & engagement.
- CABS hold monthly meetings to stay current on issues of relevance

CABs should be scheduled monthly on recurring basis (same day of week, time, etc) and should be facilitated by an identified chair/staff liaison who is the primary contact for the CAB.

CAB meetings should have a detailed agenda to help guide the discussion and a clearly delineated process of discussion & engagement.

Our consumer board meetings are disorganized

- Clear agenda identifying items to be discussed
- Provide clearly articulated procedures for discussion & participatory engagement

Meetings should use a detailed agenda identifying items to be discussed, as well as timeframes for discussions.

Written plans and schedules for our CAB are very effective

- *CAB will provide written plans, schedules and rules of respectful engagement for maximum efficiency*
- *CAB provides structure*

CABs should provide printed calendars of meetings, a timeline of goals and activities, if applicable and Rules of Respectful Engagement to govern participant behavior & communication. Consider orientation at beginning of cycle to assure members have shared understanding of roles/responsibilities.

Consumer members are easily available to assist each other

- *CAB members have an interest in the outcome of the CAB meeting*
- *CAB make themselves available to each other through icebreaker exercises, team building, phone/email trees, buddy & mentoring system*

CAB should begin each cycle/year with team-building/ice breaker exercises and use member lists, phone trees & email trees to keep members informed of meetings. Consider use of paired buddy system to keep communication flowing and explore a more formalized mentoring system for seasoned CAB members who can guide & inform newer members.

Other members on the CAB have a good understanding of the boards goals for improving client services

- *CAB will ensure that all members have a good understanding of the boards goals by Providing an orientation with a focus on roles & responsibilities, pols & procedures for client concerns, grievance procedures, client input and feedback*

CAB will ensure that all members have a good understanding of the board's goals by providing an orientation with a focus on roles & responsibilities, pols & procedures for client concerns, grievance procedures, client input and feedback.

BOARD FUNCTIONING: CONFLICT MANAGEMENT

In our consumer meetings, we talk about and resolve the necessary issues

- CABs will focus on resolving issues that arrive
- CAB members will listen to and establish conflict resolution procedures when there are disagreements among members
- CAB members will work on conflict resolution among group members

CAB should establish conflict resolution procedures to resolve issues and/or disagreements among members. Members should commit to following procedures in order to arrive at resolutions

All consumer board members work hard to solve a problem

- All CAB members should be active in solving problems & issues
- CAB members shall attempt to solve issues before the Board

Problems/issues should be identified, with realistic outcomes with the participation of CAB members.

A dispute between board members will not be resolved until everyone is happy with the decision

- CAB appoints a strong and effective leader to resolve disputes
- CAB will institute parliamentary rules and dispute resolution procedures between board members
- Develop and put in place parliamentary procedures with everyone having a voice

CAB will establish conflict/dispute resolution guidelines and use parliamentary rules to assure that meetings are run according to Robert's Rules of Order, with all members having a voice. The CAB should appoint a strong and effective leader.

When two members of our consumer board disagree, they generally involve a board leader in resolving their issue

- CAB leader should facilitate discussion to resolve issues with Board members
- CAB members will participate in the resolution of conflicts, where applicable
- CAB leader involvement prevents delayed & disruptive CAB meetings

CAB leader should be involved in the facilitation of the conflict resolution process with members in order to prevent disrupted meetings

Disagreements between consumer board members are ignored or avoided by other board members

- CAB members will listen to and establish conflict resolution protocols when there are disagreements

Conflict resolution protocols should be established and followed in order to arrive at resolutions.

When consumer board members disagree, they will ignore the problem, pretending it will go away

- CABs shall attempt to resolve all issues that come before the Board

CABs should attempt to identify/describe the problem or issue with desired/possible outcomes and/or goals and follow procedures established by the CAB.

Our board leader rarely has to resolve a dispute between consumer board members

- CAB shall appoint a strong, considerate and effective Board leader

CAB leader should possess strong leadership skills and should encourage members to resolve personal conflicts independently. When an issue or conflict arises that affects the CABs functioning, the CAB leader should become actively involved.

Consumer board members tend to withdraw from a conflict

- Group participation is the norm and expectation
- CAB members must participate to resolve conflicts
- CAB will ensure group participation and discussion when dealing with conflict (everyone has a right to state their opinion)

CAB should encourage individual member participation & discussion when dealing with conflicts/issues affecting the CAB's work/mission/goals. Everyone has a right to respectfully state their opinion and group participation is the norm and expectation.

In this consumer board, there are problems that regularly need to be referred to someone higher up

- CAB will put in place a grievance policy and procedures protocol and have an officer handle grievances
- CAB will listen to and will respect all points of view

CAB should establish a culture and atmosphere of engagement and respect which allows individuals to state their opinion. Leader should attempt to resolve issues/conflicts locally, but if management's participation is necessary to resolve an issue, it should be according to the local, established grievance policy existing at that CAB.

Within our consumer board, all points of view are considered when solving a problem

- CAB will listen to and respect all points of view by utilizing ground rules for respectful engagement when solving a problem

CAB should encourage and respect all points of view voiced by members, using Rules of Respectful engagement to govern discussions and behavior.

BOARD FUNCTIONING: TEAM EFFECTIVENESS

All board members contribute based on their experience and expertise to produce a quality solution

- Inclusion of CAB members with varying/diverse expertise and experiences will assist in producing and addressing quality solutions
- CAB should be inclusive of diverse expertise and experience in order to an effective CAB
- Inclusion of a wide variety of clients from the agency is recommended
- CAB should include a cross section of members representing all age groups

CAB should be inclusive of diverse expertise and experiences and include a wide cross section of agency clients, representing all age groups.

Our consumer board does a good job in meeting client needs

- Creation of a tool to get broader perspectives beyond those CAB members may assist/perpetuate continuing efforts to meet client needs
- Develop a tool that reaches all sectors of needs, regardless of age, race, economic stature
- Agency should develop a way to get consumer response other than just the Board
- Policies should be developed to address client needs specifically and how to address them
- Establish methods to survey consumers at large of their needs

Policies regarding input and client feedback should be developed to address specific client needs. Establish methods and/or tools to reach agency consumers/clients other than CAB members to get broad perspectives.

Our consumer board responds well to emergencies of clients

- CAB should develop a protocol for varying emergencies, but not necessarily to handle emergencies. Be a resource or referral for appropriately responding to an emergency
- Develop referral guide of resources for consumer emergencies
- Policies and procedures should be established on how to respond to client emergencies
- Board should be knowledgeable to make recommendations/ referrals in event of emergencies
- CAB should identify the contact/individual whose role is to guide their fellow PLWHAs in seeking help

CAB should encourage parent agency to develop referral guide of consumer resources during emergencies, and should act as a resource for responding to an emergency. Policies and procedures should be established on how to respond to client emergencies. CAB members should be knowledgeable or have access to information in order to make recommendations and should identify the individual(s) whose role is to guide PLWHAs in seeking help.

Our consumer board almost always meets clients' needs

- CAB should make concerted effort to meet the needs of clients within their capabilities and prioritization
- Prioritize possible client needs to establish how to meet those needs
- Concerted awareness of client needs and addressing them in a prioritized manner
- CAB should make an attempt to follow up on the resolution of client needs

CABs should develop an awareness of client needs through client feedback, surveys and other means and develop a method to prioritize expressed needs, as well as to follow up and propose solutions to address/resolve client needs (and maintain written records, respecting client confidentiality).

Although there are a variety of clients, our ability to meet clients' needs is very high

- Set priorities and understand the abilities of the CAB in terms of meeting needs of clients.
- Know when to pick battles and maximize the benefits of action to as broad a group as possible
- We should make it an objective and policy to address clients' needs
- Ensure that there is effective staff on board to address client needs. Also determine if peers are advocating for each others' needs.

While the CABs mission, goals and policies should be focused on meeting client needs, CAB members should understand the role of the CAB in prioritizing and meeting needs (as well as understanding when that is not possible). CABs should ensure that there is a mechanism in place or agency CAB staff person on board to advocate in support of clients' needs.

Overall, our consumer board functions very well together

- Establish rules of engagement and respect for all members and CAB meeting attendees and have those persons agree to this conduct
- Members should always put the affairs of the board above any personal agendas
- Establish rules of engagement for effective group participation

CAB should establish rules of engagement for all CAB members and meeting attendees and insure that all those participating agree to this conduct. Personal agendas are secondary to issues which may have a material impact on the services the agency's clients are receiving.

BOARD MEETING FUNCTIONING: COMMUNICATION

Board members are reluctant to speak their minds during the meeting

- Develop and offer opportunities for CAB members to express or introduce their thoughts or concerns. Possibly include option for public comments for attendees who may not be “official” CAB members
- Establish rules for an effective meeting, allowing for flexibility to have an effective meeting
- Establish roles and responsibilities of members, CAB staff, agency staff
- Allow for a public comment period for members who are reluctant to speak
- Develop system for written comments/input for members who are reluctant to speak
- Chair should encourage others to speak during meeting, setting time limits on individuals

CAB should develop and offer opportunities for CAB members to express themselves or introduce thoughts or concerns, whether verbal or written. Meetings agendas should be developed allowing for individuals who are reluctant to speak to use the public comment time period (with time limits) or other systems for written comments/input. CAB staff should encourage those individuals who tend not to actively participate to contribute their thoughts and/or opinions.

There is a lot of respect between consumer board members for each other and for different points of view

- See previous suggestion for establishing Rules of Engagement & Respectful Behavior
- Establish Rules of Respectful Engagement/Code of Conduct
- Reinforce overall mission of CAB

CAB should establish Rules of Respectful Engagement and a Code of Conduct and be firm about implementing it and instituting sanctions, if necessary.

During discussions, members tend to be defensive and do not react well to different points of view

- Establish rules of engagement and establish roles of CAB members
- Board Chair and leadership should be examples of behavior and tone of the meetings.
- CAB members should be pro-active to diffuse negative and defensive personalities

CABs should establish Rules of Respectful Engagement and a Code of Conduct and be firm about implementing it. CAB leadership should demonstrate appropriate behavior and set the tone for the meeting and be pro-active in diffusing negative comments and preventing escalation of a conflict or an issue.

Sometimes the meetings are very tense

- Establish time restraints for individuals who are speaking which will limit heightened or intense interactions over a prolonged period of time
- Establish rules for an effective meeting allowing for flexibility to have a meeting which addresses most members’ concerns. Establish roles/ responsibilities.

CAB meeting procedures should establish time restraints in order to diffuse or de-escalate heightened interaction between members and/or members and agency staff. Agendas should be developed with CAB leader allowing for flexibility to discuss issues not previously identified.

The meetings offer a safe place to discuss most ideas and concerns

- Goals and objectives should be outlined before each meeting
- Comments should be made to affirm the safety of each attendee. Make certain that a safe space is established (confidentiality, etc) and enforced.

CAB should establish/develop a climate of trust and safety, where confidentiality is assured and enforced.

BOARD MEETING FUNCTIONING: LEADERSHIP

Meetings are often dominated by the same people

- Limit time to speak and stick to it
- Establish rules & policies for participating in meetings
- Leadership tends to dominate conversation and should not prioritize their own personal agendas. Encouraging others who haven't spoken is important
- There should be a concerted effort by the facilitator to encourage those who are hesitant to participate.

Establish rules and policies for member participation in meetings, while limiting individual's comments to 2 -3 minutes. Leadership should not prioritize personal agendas and not dominate the conversation, while encouraging those who are hesitant to participate.

It is clear who is responsible for what actions at the end of the discussion

- Insure that the meeting has structure and pay attention to how the meeting transitions from one topic to another
- A designated facilitator should be recognized for each meeting
- Before closing the meeting, clarity and a written understanding of next steps in responding to issues/concerns should be completed
- Make sure that there are ground rules for all meetings.

CAB should assure shared understanding of roles and responsibilities, with a designated facilitator recognized for each meeting. The agenda should clearly state who responsible parties are for presentations, actions & follow up and there should be clarity before ending the meeting of next steps/parking lot issues, etc. (to be captured in written minutes for the CAB's record).

One or two consumer board members seem to get blamed frequently when problems arise

- Establish protocols to ensure a fair and equal environment that is blameless.

CAB should develop Rules of Engagement and Code of Conduct to assure a fair environment, focusing on solutions and not blame or accusation.

Discussion is often scattered, and at times we have a difficult time reaching consensus

- CAB needs to develop time frame and protocols to address agenda items
- Facilitator responsibility to keep to the agenda.

CAB staff should develop agenda (with participation of leadership), with designated times for discussion/action items. CAB facilitator has responsibility to keep to agenda, but also to be flexible when group consensus supports additional discussion.

At times meetings are dominated by one or two individuals

- Seek viewpoints of others at CAB meetings. Avoid repetition by the same individuals
- Equal time should be given to all and chairs should seek all members input
- Appoint a facilitator that has strong leadership qualities and establish protocols for effective meetings, e.g., facilitation skills training, active listening, etc.

CAB facilitator should possess strong leadership, facilitation and listening skills. CAB chairs should seek input and viewpoints (verbal or written) from all, allowing everyone a chance to express their thoughts.

The facilitator creates a comfortable atmosphere, fosters communication and reinforces members' input

- Facilitators should foster a safe space and encourage inclusion and different perspectives
- Ensure that facilitator established rules of engagement and directs the group with strong, working effective group.

CAB facilitator should have strong active listening skills which fosters communication and validates member input.

Consumer board members are held accountable for the things they agree to do

- Identify the CAB members that will take the lead on addressing actions desired and agreed on by the board
- Create agenda developed by staff and CAB members. Ensure understanding of roles and responsibilities for CAB members' accountability
- Ensure that CAB minutes record all actions taken/to be taken and that parking lot issues/report backs to CAB are part of the meeting agenda.

Ensure that CAB minutes record all actions taken/to be taken and that parking lot issues/report backs to CAB are part of the next meeting's agenda. CAB leadership should also identify CAB members who agree to take lead roles in addressing follow up actions (as agreed to be CAB). Agenda should be developed by CAB staff and leadership to assure all perspectives are included in discussions, presentations, etc.

Often, the facilitator tends to dominate the discussion

- Create specific roles for facilitation that limits and directs what he/she can/should do
- Facilitators should keep to their roles.

CAB policies and procedures should clearly identify role of facilitator that articulates what he/she can/cannot do.

**PUBLIC COMMENT/ BOROUGH UPDATES: HIV NETWORKING ACTIVITIES/ /ANNOUNCEMENTS:
ADJOURNMENT:**

There was no public comment.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:30PM.