



1
2 Meeting of the
3 **Priority Setting and Resource Allocation Committee**
4 Eli Camhi, Chair
5

6 Thursday, February 7, 2008, 3:00-5:00 pm
7 GMHC, 119 West 24th Street, New York, NY
8

9 **Members Present:** Eli Camhi, Sean Cahill, Felicia Carroll, Sharen Duke, Joan
10 Edwards, Soraya Elcock, Linda Fraser, Marya Gilborn, Steve Hemraj, Jennifer
11 Irwin, Peter Laqueur, Fabienne Laraque, MD, MPH, Hilda Mateo, Jan Carl
12 Park, Tom Petro, John Samuels, Edward Telzak, MD
13

14 **Members Absent:** Lloyd Bishop, Antionettea Etienne, Terri Faulkner, Terry
15 Hamilton, Patrick McGovern, Walter Okoroanyanwu, MD
16

17 **DOHMH Staff Present:** JoAnn Hilger, David Klotz, Rafael Molina, John Rojas,
18 Nina Rothschild, Clarissa Silva, Darryl Wong
19

20 **MHRA Staff Present:** Rachel Miller
21

22 **Others Present:** Victor Benadava, Sean Robin, Terry Troia
23

24 **Material Distributed:** Agenda; minutes from the PSRA Committee meeting
25 on January 3, 2008; Ryan White Program Services Definitions; Year 2008 (Year
26 18) Ryan White BASE Application Spending Plan with changes to service
27 category allocations approved by the Priority Setting and Resource Allocation
28 Committee; Year 2008 (Year 18) Ryan White BASE Application Spending Plan
29 with reallocation of mental health, early intervention, and TB funding to
30 emergency transitional housing; Year 2 (8/1/08-7/31/09) MAI Spending Plan
31 with same carrying cost approved for Year 1; Year 2 MAI Spending Plan with
32 emergency transitional housing programs; old Service Category Criteria
33 Analysis Grid (revised Spring 2007); proposed new Service Category
34 Analysis Grid (revised February 2008); Planning Council calendar for
35 February 2008.
36

37 **Welcome/Introductions:** The meeting opened with a round of introductions.
38

39 **Public Comment:** Victor Benadava stated that he has lived with HIV/AIDS for
40 the past eight years. Food, nutrition, and housing are still very important to

1 PLWHA. People living with this illness lose body fat because of the
2 medications, and eating in order to regain that fat is very important. Carla
3 Lewis stated that she is very committed to raising consciousness about not
4 dichotomizing prevention and care. The UN talks about HIV, food and
5 nutrition, and the devastating incapacity associated with this illness. Food
6 stamps do not assure the nutritional quality required by the medications.

7
8 **Review of the Meeting Packet:** Nina Rothschild reviewed the contents of the
9 meeting packet.

10
11 **Review of the Minutes:** Mr. Camhi reviewed the minutes from the previous
12 meeting of the PSRA Committee on January 3, 2008. The minutes were
13 accepted by all present with two abstentions and no votes in opposition.

14
15 **HOPWA/Ryan White Funding Proposals:** Jan Carl Park introduced John
16 Rojas, Director of Housing, who oversees the HOPWA (Housing Opportunities
17 for Persons with AIDS) Program in the Care, Treatment, and Housing (CTH)
18 unit of the Bureau of HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control. Mr. Rojas noted that
19 the CTH unit constitutes both the HOPWA program and the Ryan White Part A
20 program which enables closer collaboration within the Bureau. The CTH staff
21 assessed funding priorities across both programs and asked whether there is
22 a better way to provide rental assistance than the methods currently in use by
23 the Bureau. Housing is provided through both the Ryan White Program and
24 the HOPWA Program, and both funding streams target (among other
25 populations) the undocumented. Ryan White housing, however, is meant to
26 be transitional, whereas HOPWA housing can be transitional or permanent.
27 Currently, the Bureau is proposing to increase HOPWA funding for rental
28 assistance by approximately \$2,518,756 million, the amount currently funded
29 by Ryan White – Part A for emergency rental assistance. In turn, HOPWA
30 would shift approximately \$2,475,000 million in homeless/street youth and
31 SRO outreach contracts to Ryan White to offset the increase in HOPWA rental
32 assistance. This shift, to be effective in 2009, will consolidate all emergency
33 rental assistance and associated administrative costs within the HOPWA
34 portfolio, rather than having emergency rental assistance provided through
35 two different funding streams. The Planning Council, in turn, would not be
36 obligating itself to specific contracts but, rather, to serve homeless/street
37 youth and SRO residents in the amount of \$2,475,000 for outreach and linkage
38 to care programs.

39
40 Committee members engaged in extensive discussion of this proposal. Eli
41 Camhi asked whether any clients would lose services, noted that both housing
42 and outreach are non-core services within HRSA's service definitions, and
43 stated that the exchange would not affect the 75/25 core/non-core allocation
44 of our portfolio. Ms. Duke noted that the money is currently being used by
45 HOPWA for outreach to clients, some of whom have an unknown serostatus,

1 whereas Ryan White funding is for people living with HIV/AIDS. Is the
2 exchange allowable, given the restrictions in patient populations to be served
3 by these funding streams? Mr. Park directed group members to the third
4 page of the handout of HRSA definitions of services which speaks to that
5 question. Dr. Cahill asked whether the Bureau had discussed this potential
6 funding exchange with Housing Works, to which Mr. Rojas responded that the
7 proposal had been discussed by members of the Housing Advisory Work
8 Group (HAWG) of CTH, comprised of housing vendors and consumers. Dr.
9 Laraque commented on the importance of serving homeless/street youth and
10 SRO residents and noted that the Ryan White program would continue to
11 target those high risk groups. She noted that we are not talking here about
12 specific contracts but rather about the allocation of dollars to these two
13 specific target populations.

14
15 Dr. Telzak asked whether the Ryan White portfolio currently has programs
16 targeting youth and SRO residents. Ms. Miller noted that although targeting
17 these populations is not a requirement, we do fund programs serving these
18 groups. Mr. Petro urged PSRA Committee members not to separate Ryan
19 White and HOPWA: these two entities are part of one comprehensive stream.
20 Mr. Camhi made a motion to no longer fund emergency rental assistance
21 under RW, with the commitment that HOPWA will expand emergency rental
22 assistance by \$2.5 million. The PSRA Committee (and the Planning Council as
23 a whole) is not limited to service types in agreeing to the HOPWA/Ryan White
24 transfer, rather, must serve these two specific populations: street/homeless
25 youth and SRO residents in the amount of \$2,475,000. The exchange does not
26 create any gap in time during which these clients will not be served. Mr.
27 Petro seconded Mr. Camhi's motion and reminded the group that the end
28 product of this internal discussion among PSRA members will be a
29 recommendation to the Planning Council. PSRA Committee members voted in
30 favor of exchanging the service elements between Ryan White and HOPWA
31 with one vote in opposition and no abstentions. Mr. Laqueur requested lists of
32 services currently funded by HOPWA and by Ryan White. The proposed
33 transfer will be effective July 1, 2009.

34
35 **Ryan White BASE and MAI Funding:** Ms. Hilger reviewed the spending
36 plans included in the packet. At the last PSRA meeting, Committee members
37 discussed what to do if we receive less money from HRSA than the amount for
38 which we applied and what to do with the money turned back to DOHMH from
39 contracts that were not executed. During the course of that discussion,
40 Committee members agreed to leave unspent mental health funds in the
41 mental health service category and to move unspent funds from TB and early
42 intervention services to treatment adherence. However, DOHMH is now faced
43 with another problem that requires further reallocation of funds. For 2007,
44 \$1.5 million dollars of transitional housing were covered by HOPWA via one-
45 time new funding. HOPWA is no longer able to cover those costs, and the

1 Planning Council must decide how to cover the cost of that housing. If the
2 EMA receives the same amount of money for the coming year that we
3 received for the current year, we will be unable to cover the cost of the
4 transitional housing temporarily paid for by HOPWA unless we cut other
5 programs. The amount of unspent funding reprogrammed at the last PSRA
6 meeting was \$891,000. Mr. Petro suggested that at the expense of not
7 enhancing treatment adherence and mental health, we use the unspent dollars
8 to cover the housing costs for seven months. All members of the Committee
9 voted in favor of this proposal, with one abstention.

10
11 **Priority Setting Tool:** Dr. Laraque reintroduced the suggested revisions to
12 the PSRA priority setting tool. She noted that the current maximum score of
13 58.5 is confusing and that a maximum score of 100 would make more sense.
14 Committee members engaged in an extensive discussion about the proposed
15 revisions, raising issues such as how some of the information entered into the
16 chart, such as the cost per client, would translate into a score; the fluctuation
17 between agencies in cost per client and in utilization; how the numbers
18 entered into the field for service utilization would factor into the score; how to
19 factor in trends in utilization over time; and the importance of including a
20 measure of efficiency (combining utilization and cost). The revised tool
21 should be complete by May. PSRA Committee members agreed to do
22 marathon meetings to refine and enhance each category within the tool.

23
24 **Next Meeting:** Members of the PSRA Committee will convene again on March
25 6th from 2:30-5:30.

26
27 **Follow-Up:** Distribute a list of services currently funded by Ryan White and
28 by HOPWA, as per Peter Laqueur's request.

29
30
31
32