



Meeting of the

**Priority Setting & Resource Allocation Committee**

Jennifer Irwin & Eli Camhi, Co-Chairs

Thursday, June 7, 2007 3:00–5:00 PM

GMHC, 119 W. 24<sup>th</sup> Street, New York, NY

**Members Present:** Jennifer Irwin (Co-Chair), Eli Camhi (Co-Chair), SJ Avery, Lloyd Bishop, Felicia Carroll, Soraya Elcock (alt. for Patrick McGovern), Aquilino Gabor (alternate for Joanna Omi), Pater Laqueur, Hilda Mateo, Jan Carl Park, Tom Petro, Joshua Sippen, Edward Telzak, MD

**Members Absent:** Bruce Agins, MD, Humberto Cruz, Linda Fraser, Steve Hemraj, Darryl Ng, Walter Okoroanyanwu, Terry Troia

**DOHMH Staff Present:** David Klotz, Rafael Molina, Grace Moon, John Rojas, Nina Rothschild

**MHRA Staff Present:** Rachel Miller

**Others Present:** Ken De Jesus, Ruth Finkelstein, Julie Netherland, Raul Plasencia



**Material Distributed:** Agenda; minutes for May 3, 2007 PSRA Committee meeting; spreadsheets prepared by HIV CS showing takedowns by service category for years 15 and 16, underspending by service category as of the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> quarters of year 15, and underspending by service category as of the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> quarters of year 16; a spreadsheet showing EMA priority scores for 2007 and 2008; the service category criteria analysis grid (under development); and a statement regarding the Notice of Grant Award under the Ryan White CARE Act Part A.

**I. Payer of Last Resort Study:** Dr. Ruth Finkelstein of the New York Academy of Medicine presented a tool designed to identify other (non-Ryan White) payers for services for PLWHA. The tool does not define service capacity, access, or quality but, rather, lists funders and programs. PSRA Committee members discussed the tool, commenting, for example, that it would be useful to distinguish between what is and is not an entitlement; that the tool is a vehicle to tell us whether other sources of funding exist so that we can determine whether we are, in fact, the payer of last resort; that it can be used to make sure that people aren't double dipping; and that we can use it to assess how much funding other entities provide and, therefore, how much we need to allocate. It helps us to understand the delivery system and see what resources are available. We probably have a lot of clients who are eligible for Medicaid but are nevertheless receiving Title I resources. One problem noted with the tool is that it lists the HIV Law Project as a funder, but the HIV Law Project is in fact a provider. Mr. Camhi suggested that we place the tool on the Planning Council website, date stamp it, and prepare to address questions about how to maintain it, as it is really a query tool in its present form. Service providers can use the tool to see where they want to add programs, and we can breathe life into the tool by adding dollars and geographic information. The Planning Council has also funded the service mapping project, collecting data on HIV services around the City. We should make sure that the data sources for this payer of last resort tool and for the mapping project are mutually inclusive.

**II. Minutes from May 3, 2007 PSRA Committee Meeting:** Dr. Telzak noted a correction to page 2, line 27, stating that 25% of individuals who come to the emergency room have fee-for-service Medicaid, which is the only mechanism for ensuring reimbursement for HIV testing. Medicaid managed care is an uncertain payer for testing, and commercial insurance is an unlikely payer at the present time. The minutes were accepted with no votes opposed and three abstentions.

**III. Spreadsheets from HIV CS Showing Takedowns and Underspending:** Rachel Miller reminded Committee members that the original question for MHRA was whether there are patterns of underspending within service categories. MHRA presented information intended to address this question at a previous PSRA Committee meeting, but Humberto Cruz of the AIDS Institute was concerned that the spreadsheet showing underspending at the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter was misleading. MHRA has now prepared a sheet showing underspending at the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> quarters. The new spreadsheet looks better, showing, for example, that at the end of the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of year 15, 36.11% of funds were unspent in ambulatory outpatient care, but at the end of the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of year 15, 0% of funds in this service category were unspent. The spreadsheet on takedowns shows a takedown for underspending of \$66,222 in year 15 and a takedown of



\$218,855 for underspending in year 16. If any agency continually underspends, MHRA make take it down permanently. Ms. Miller noted that there was a little spike in underspending last year.

**IV. EMA Priority Scores and the Service Category Criteria Analysis Grid:** Mr. Park spoke briefly about the spreadsheet showing updated EMA priority scores and the service category criteria analysis grid, noting that scores for some service categories were raised because of services newly defined as core in RW HATMA. He also stated that the PSRA Committee needs more direction about the definition of some service categories from the Integration of Care Committee.

**V. Update on MAI Application:** Mr. Park noted that the development of DOHMH’s application for MAI funding was a very time-intensive process and that the application has been submitted. Mr. Park also spoke about the size of the total Ryan White grant from HRSA this year, noting that at this time DOHMH is receiving close to \$7.6 million dollars less this year than it received last year, and the total loss of funding may be close to \$13.3 million.

**VI: New Business.** S.J. Avery introduced a report by the Women of Color Policy Network at the Wagner School of New York University. Some of the information in the report is very striking; for example, 20% of all women with HIV in the United States live in New York City. This report may be a useful addition to the data provided by the CHAIN survey and provides fascinating information on the feminization of poverty and HIV. A summary of the report can be obtained on the United Way’s website. DOHMH staff will obtain a copy of the report and send it to our grant writer, Mike Isbell. Dr. Telzak noted that some of the PSRA Committee’s rankings of service categories are impressionistic, rather than data driven, and a report such as this could augment our supply of data and would be useful for consumers.

Mr. Park also thanked Grace Moon for her outstanding work with the Ryan White Planning Council, commending her for her ability to think strategically and plan for the future.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:50 pm.